

Summary Report on Pilot Audit of ICDS in Rajasthan

Scope of Pilot:

- 11 districts were chosen to take Rajasthan's geographic diversity into account
 - 1) Jaipur (Urban)
 - 2) Ajmer (Rural)
 - 3) Alwar (Rural)
 - 4) Jodhpur (Urban)
 - 5) Udaipur (Tribal)
 - 6) Rajsamand (Rural)
 - 7) Sirohi (Rural)
 - 8) Barmer (Rural)
 - 9) Bikaner (Rural)
 - 10) Baran (Tribal)
 - 11) Karauli (Rural)
- One gram panchayat or municipal ward, whatever applicable, were chosen in each of the to carry out pilot social audit of Anganwadis present in it
- 52 total Anganwadi Kendra across 9 gram panchayats and 2 municipal wards

Pre-roll Out Process:

- **Composition of social audit team:** *6 members per team*
 - 3 social workers with an experience of social audits, campaigns, and movements
 - 1 Asha Sahayogini
 - 1 Saathin – *Woman employee of Department of Women and Child Development (GoR), who is selected by the Gram Sabha tasked with educating women on health and nutrition related issues as well as empower them socially and economically.*
 - 1 ward member / councillor
- **Two-day residential training** of social audit team in Jaipur:



- **Day 1:**
 - o Department's presentation on both the schemes (Poshan Abhiyan and PMMVY) around scheme guidelines, record management, and measures taken during COVID
 - o Training on Social Audit standards issued by the CAG
 - o Group exercise of understanding available records of the anganwadis, which were being audited
- **Day 2:**
 - o Training on social audit formats
 - o Q&A session with the department
- **Two-day break** before the pilot is roll out in order to provide time to the social audit team to travel back to their districts and
 - *access missing records from anganwadi / local department*
 - *compile collected records into verifiable formats*

Pilot Roll Out:

- Seven-day process
- **Day 1:** Meeting of social audit team with all anganwadi karyakartas and sahayikas, local WCD officials, and local volunteers who were mobilized to support the social audit team with the audit process



- **Day 2 to Day 6:**
 - o *Field verification / door to door visits* to meet with beneficiaries and verification of delivery of entitlements as per records
 - o *Collecting citizen grievances* and submitting/filing these grievances on Rajasthan Sampark (181).

- *Educating citizens on their rights and entitlements through community level meetings and distribution of pamphlets during physical verification*



- **Day 7:** Public hearing in all 11 districts to share findings from the social audits as well as offer a platform to citizens to voice their grievances. These public hearings were attended by more than 2200 people, majority were women. Administrative officers starting from Additional Chief Secretary, WCD, Director WCD, Poshahar in-charge from WCD to Deputy Directors, CDPO, Lady Supervisors, and elected representatives also participated in the Jan Sunwais as jury/panel members.



Summary of Findings:

A. Exclusion of registered beneficiaries or irregular distribution to registered beneficiaries

- a) Many beneficiaries were being kept away from receiving the entitled benefits due to anganwadis receiving ration for a limited number of beneficiaries every month. Additionally, the number of beneficiaries within each category, who ration needs to be distributed to, is also fixed.
- b) For example – in all five anganwadis of Jaipur, dry ration was received, every month, for only 34 beneficiaries (5 pregnant women, 5 lactating mothers, and 24 children), which excluded approximately 35 percent registered beneficiaries, on average, every month from receiving dry ration.

Aanganwadi Name	Pregnant Women	Lactating Mothers	Children (7M - 3Y)	Total Regd. Beneficiaries	Total Beneficiaries Receiving Ration	% Excluded Regd. Beneficiaries
Kalakar Colony	10	9	38	57	34	40.35%
Nehru Nagar	6	10	30	46	34	26.09%
Prem Colony	11	6	30	47	34	27.66%
Bassi 1	12	15	33	60	34	43.33%
Bassi 2	7	14	35	56	34	39.29%

- c) Anganwadi karyakartas managed the shortage of ration by arbitrarily choosing beneficiaries every month for ration distribution and often give ration only to one member in a family in case there are multiple beneficiaries within that family.

B. Denial of full entitlements as beneficiaries received less quantity of dry ration than shown in records

- a) All 11 districts had cases when the total quantity of ration received by the beneficiaries were less than what was shown in the records
- b) Udaipur, Sirohi, Johpur, and Alwar for example, during field verification of records, identified atleast 170 such beneficiaries who had not received full entitlements and the records showed otherwise.
- c) Distribution registers in some cases also had counterfeit signatures and thumbprints as well as missing signature/thumbprints against distribution record.

महिला एवं बाल विकास विभाग, राजस्थान										पोषाहार वितरण रजिस्टर										
6 माह - 1 वर्ष के बच्चों का विकेन्द्रीकरण										केन्द्र का नाम										
क्र.सं.	पंचायत/वार्ड का नाम	ग्राम का नाम	मि.का.सं.	पंचायत का नाम	बाल का नाम	पिता का नाम	पिता का पता	पिता का मोबा. नं.	पिता का पता	पिता का पता	दिनांक	वजन	ऊँचाई	विकास	विकास	विकास	विकास	विकास	विकास	विकास
1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20

C. Eligible beneficiaries not registered at anganwadis

- a) Lack of coverage was one of the biggest issues found in all 11 districts where the enrolment at anganwadis were found significantly less while more eligible beneficiaries were identified during field verification
- b) For example, in Ajmer, 130 such eligible beneficiaries were identified who were not enrolled in any anganwadi despite meeting the criteria
- c) Enrolment of out of school adolescent girls and malnourished children were not found in most districts. Jaipur, for example, had ZERO out of school adolescent girls enrolled at anganwadis, despite the social audit team identifying many of them in communities.

D. Issues related to maintenance and regularity of records

- a) Records provided to the social audit team differed with actual records present at anganwadi kendras in almost all districts
- b) Anganwadis across the state had different methods of maintaining the records due to absence of standard guidelines
- c) Almost all records and registers, across the state, had excessive use of whitener and malpractices like arbitrarily deletion of beneficiary names, removal of signatures/thumbprints, post facto changes in distribution quantity, as well as changes in names of beneficiaries were found.

		अ. लि. का.											
1	55 परी	पुसा	11/9/19	SC	521571	271802						8441039	663
2	14 काठिया	काठिया	8/8/19	अन्य								900148	5665
3	63 काठिया	काठिया	31/10/19	SC								8112203	673
4	60 काठिया	पुसा	5/6/19	SC								701426	426
5	54 काठिया	पुसा	16/4/19	SC	932762	547728						83504	84664
6	155 काठिया	काठिया	7/4/19	अन्य	444494	568953						844103	9663
7	22 काठिया	काठिया	11/9/19	ST	820847	022803						637650	7188

E. Issues related to PMMVY implementation

- Enrolment of beneficiaries were found significantly low in almost all districts
- Most beneficiaries, across all 11 districts, who enrolled for PMMVY did not get a dated acknowledgement receipt upon submission of A/B/C form/s, which makes application tracking very difficult.

F. Accountability and transparency related issues

- Public display of entitlements and rights of citizens were absent in almost all anganwadis.
- Public disclosure of enrolled beneficiaries at anganwadi kendra and beneficiary-wise distribution of entitlements was absent in all 52 anganwadis.
- There was no grievance redress mechanism in case anganwadi karyakartas misbehave or illegitimately deny rights of a citizen at anganwadi kendras in terms of a grievance submission box or a local grievance redress committee.
- None of the beneficiaries, across all 11 districts, were given acknowledgement receipts at the time of ration distribution mentioning the date of distribution and quantity of ration for them to keep a track of it.
- The window of ration distribution was found to be too short (one or two days maximum) as well as the community and beneficiaries were also unaware about a schedule for distribution since there was no system of spreading awareness before the scheduled distribution.

Recommendations for WCD Department:

A. Related to Accountability and Transparency

- Beneficiary wise entitlements should be displayed publicly via wall painting at anganwadis, and scheme related information, rights of beneficiaries, and list of

all benefits and entitlements should be displayed publicly via flex at gram panchayat office and ward offices.

- 2) Local Vigilance Committees (निगरानी कमेटी) should be formed for every anganwadi and the names of members in that committee should be available in public domain (both online and offline); The role of Vigilance Committee will be critical during receiving the ration stock as well as distribution of ration by anganwadi karyakartas.
- 3) Ration should be distributed publicly in present of the community and the local vigilance committee, and a dated acknowledgement receipt should be provided to the beneficiary.
- 4) One 'Poshahar Card' can be made for each beneficiary in order for them to keep a signed record of all the entitlements and services availed from a particular anganwadi.
- 5) Grievance register in a physical form and grievance helpline details should be made available publicly at anganwadi kendras while also putting details of grievance filing through 181.
- 6) Details like total enrolled beneficiaries, beneficiary-wise ration distribution details, inventory details of an anganwadi kendra, stock level etc. information should be put on a MIS that should also be accessible to public.
- 7) Day and time of ration distribution should be written on the wall or should be displayed on a board outside the anganwadi kendra.
- 8) Department website should display name, titles, and contact details of all administrative officers as well as organization's structure.

B. Expand coverage via state-wide enrolment campaign

- 1) State-wide enrolment campaign should be launched in order to deliver entitlements to all eligible beneficiaries across districts.

C. Social audits of anganwadi kendras should be institutionalized by the department through **scaling up the pilot** to all districts and preparing a **social audit manual** as well as **guidelines/framework for concurrent social audits**.

D. The department can designate one day across the state for the distribution of entitlements as well as educate communities on their rights. Such a day can also be called as "**Anganwadi Divas**" for which a separate agenda can be chalked out and should be promoted/advertised extensively in the state.

- E. Annual plans prepared by anganwadis should be made participatory and demand-based through an annual survey.
- F. In addition to the annual survey, SOP should be devised to capture real-time demand every month to supply and deliver entitlements for all enrolled/eligible beneficiaries.
- G. All anganwadi karyakartas should be trained to manage records in a standardized manner.
- H. Records and documentation need to be made easy and efficient for anganwadi karyakartas. Some experienced members of SR Abhiyan can help the department in preparing standardized register formats through a workshop.
- I. Anganwadis should have storage facilities as well as an inventory register.
- J. Rent amount provided to anganwadis, especially for the ones operating in urban areas, should be increased.
- K. “Matritva Committees” (Mother Committees) should be activated at each anganwadis.

Impact of Pilot Social Audits:

- *Key decisions taken by the Additional Chief Secretary, Department of Women and Child Development, Government of Rajasthan:*
 - Poshan Card will be issued to each beneficiary in order to increase accountability and transparency, as well as increase beneficiary’s awareness around their rights and entitlements
 - List of entitlements and beneficiary-wise delivery of entitlement on a monthly basis to be displayed by wall painting at Anganwadi Kendras and Flex at Panchayat Bhawan in order to enhance transparency.
 - FIR was filed against an Anganwadi Karyakarta in Barmer for mismanagement of funds as well as issues of corruption and fraud in ration distribution.
 - Abhiyan will work with the WCD department in conducting workshops for Anganwadi Karyakartas and Sahayaks on simplifying data capture formats of registers as well as maintenance of beneficiary-wise information in those registers.
 - Insights from the Social Audit will be used to set up the MIS for WCD department and abhiyan will work closely with the department to design, implement, and monitor the information available on MIS

- Social Audit manual will be prepared along with guidelines in order to institutionalize the process and scale up social audits in all districts.
- Number of ASHA Sahayoginis trained on conducting social audits: 10
- Number of Saathin trained on conducting social audits: 9
- Number of elected representatives trained on conducting social audits: 10
- Number of anganwadi karyakartas and sahayaks sensitized about social audit process: 104
- Number of department officials sensitized about social audit process: 25